









# **NDC TRANSPARENCY CHECK**



## **EU ASSESSMENT**

## MAKING EU'S 2020 NDC UPDATE MORE TRANSPARENT

September 2020





1	INTRODUCTION TO THE 'NDC TRANSPARENCY CHECK'
2	SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS
3	DETAILED ASSESSMENT6

The NDC Transparency Check provides recommendations on what information countries should provide in their 2020 NDC Update to ensure its clarity, transparency, and understanding.

This is done by evaluating existing NDCs and assessing information provided in the annex of 4/CMA.1 under Article 4.8. of the Paris Agreement, to come up with clear and practical recommendation on which information should be included in the 2020 NDC Update in order to be in full conformance with international agreements.



#### INTRODUCTION TO THE 'NDC TRANSPARENCY CHECK'

The Paris Agreement was adopted in 2015 at the 21<sup>st</sup> United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change Conference of the Parties (UNFCCC COP 21), and came into force a year later. Almost all countries are currently signatories of the Agreement.<sup>1</sup>

The objective of the NDC Transparency Check is to provide a robust reference to assess whether Parties have communicated their mitigation efforts through Nationally Determined Contribution (NDCs) that are clear, transparent and understandable, in terms of the requirements set out in the Paris Agreement, its accompanying decision (1/CP.21) and Annex I to decision 4/CMA.1, which sets out the "information to facilitate clarity, transparency and understanding of nationally determined contributions".

Legally, the Annex is only binding from the second NDC onwards. However, Parties are "strongly encouraged" to apply the Annex to updated NDCs, due in 2020.

While the approach taken for this assessment is based on conformance with the Annex, this 'NDC Transparency Check' aims to assess both:

- i. Conformance of a country's NDC with the Katowice Rule Book, and;
- ii. The extent to which a country has provided additional information in relation to each element of the Annex which enhances clarity, transparency and understanding.

The European Commission is revising its current NDC, first submitted as an intended nationally-determined contribution to the UNFCCC in 2015 and which became the EU's NDC in 2016 upon EU ratification. The assessment is applied to the existing NDC, mindful of the fact that provision of the relevant information was not a legal requirement at the time and there was not a common guideline in place for its elaboration.

The NDC Transparency Check aims to provide information to support the NDC revision process, by identifying gaps in the information provided in previous NDCs on the EU's mitigation goals and their underlying policies and measures that is needed for clarity, transparency and understanding, and useful to provide greater clarity on the likely outcome of NDCs collectively.



The detailed methodology as well as other assessment are available on: **www.climate-transparency.org** 

A possible exception is the United States of America, which is currently a signatory, but has started the withdrawal process from the Agreement, and is expected to withdraw formally in November 2020.

# 02

#### **SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

The European Green Deal, announced in December 2019, is a plan for a sustainable economy for the EU. It is the flagship initiative and a strategy priority for the European Commission. It provides an action plan to boost the efficient use of resources by moving to a clean, circular economy; to restore biodiversity; and to cut pollution.

The EU aims to be climate-neutral in 2050. As part of the European Green Deal, the European Commission proposed the European Climate Law in March 2020 to turn this political commitment into a legal obligation.

On 16 September 2020, the Commission revealed the proposal to reduce emissions by at least 55% by 2030 compared to 1990 (the current target is the reduction of at least 40%), based on an impact assessment of costs and benefits. The EU will decide whether the proposed target will replace the existing target in its NDC Update, expected for the end of 2020.

However, it is not just the stated target that is important. The target needs to be accompanied by additional information in

The current EU NDC was submitted by the Latvian Presidency of the Council of the European Union and the European Commission on behalf of the European Union and its Member States as an INDC in March 2015. It became the EU's NDC in October 2016, when the EU formally ratified the Paris Agreement.

It is a unique case within the UNFCCC process since, although all EU Member States are formally Parties of the Paris Agreement, they all present one common NDC, which is first negotiated at the EU level. Thus, the EU's NDC goes through a more complex process of negotiations among its Member States compared to other NDCs.

Additionally, after the withdrawal of the UK from the European Union on 31 January 2020, the former Member State of the European Union will need to submit its own NDC. The EU will at the same time present the revised NDC on behalf of not 28 as in 2015, but 27 Member States.

An assessment of the NDC target can be found in the Brown to Green Report: **www.climate-transparency.org**A detailed analysis is provided by the Climate Action Tracker: **www.climateactiontracker.org** 

order to ensure clarity, transparency and understanding of the NDC. Transparency is key for accountability. In turn, accountability drives action!

This assessment provides a detailed analysis of the existing NDC and highlights the opportunities for a transparent and enhanced new NDC in 2020, based on the requirements set out in the Paris Agreement.

The assessment shows that the EU's current NDC already covers several elements as prescribed by the Paris Agreement. However, it also shows that when revising its NDC, the EU should enhance the information included.

From a political perspective, the EU's leadership is more important than ever. By raising its target in the updated NDC and increasing its transparency, the EU would send an important signal to other big emitters, would underline its position as an important international player and would set an example for other countries.

#### **EU's current NDC target**



At least

reduction of greenhouse gasses by 2030 compared to 1990 levels.

#### New target proposed by the European Commission



At least **55%** 

reduction of greenhouse gasses by 2030 compared to 1990 levels.

To enhance the transparency of its 2020 NDC Update, the EU should implement the following key recommendations (further information on the recommendations can be drawn from the detailed assessment below):

ICTU Category	Current NDC	Room for improvements for NDC Update 2020
Reference point	The EU's NDC is relative to a 1990 base year.	State source of data for quantifying the reference point as well as provide information under which the EU would update the value of the reference indicators. If EU target contains a separate target for the land sector, provide or confirm the reference point or period for this separate target.
Time frame	Period of implementation provided in the form of a start date: 1 January 2021 and end date: 31 December 2030.	Provide a single-/multi-year reference in the time frames for implementation.
Scope and Coverage	No specific information was provided on carbon pools and it is not clear on what terms the land sector will be included in the target.	Expressly cover the land sector and explain how the land sector is included in the EU target. Explain whether the EU has a separate target for the land sector or for removals, and if so how this target relates to the EU's emission reduction target.
Planning process	No information was provided in the EU's NDC on the arrangements in place to prepare the NDC. No information was provided on the relevant stakeholder processes, or whether the NDC was conducted in a gender-responsive manner, whether local communities and indigenous peoples were consulted.	Provide information on institutional arrangements for developing and implementing the NDCs, incl. consultation processes public participation and engagement with local communities and indigenous peoples, in a gender-responsive manner.
Assumptions, and methodological approaches	No information is provided on how emissions and removals will be accounted for (other than the specification that it will be a "comprehensive accounting approach"), and the NDC states that the way in which the land sector will be accounted for will be decided in future.	Provide detailed information on removal of emissions and detailed description of how the EU will account for the land sector in its NDC. Clarify whether EU's LULUCF emissions are included in the base year.
Fairness and ambition	The EU NDC implies, in the relevant section, that its NDC is fair and ambitious. No grounds are however provided for why this would be fair and only very few grounds other than a reference to per capita emissions as to how its NDC could be considered fair.	Provide link to the long term temperature goal of the Paris Agreement. Include grounds on why the NDC target is fair and why it constitutes the EU's "highest possible ambition".
Contribution to UNFCCC Article 2	The EU's NDC does not contain any references to Article 2 of the Convention. The EU's NDC states that EU emissions peaked in 1979. No other relevant information is provided.	Provide more specific information on the consistency of the EU's target with the now more ambitious long-term temperature goal adopted under the Convention. Provide information on when a balance between emissions and removals will be achieved within the EU.



#### **DETAILED ASSESSMENT**

The following assessment is undertaken on the basis of Annex I to 4/CMA.1 (agreed in 2018), which contains information necessary for clarity, transparency and understanding that Parties are strongly encouraged to provide in relation to their first NDCs, including when communicating or updating these NDCs by 2020. The European Commission is revising its current NDC, first submitted as an intended nationally-determined contribution to the UNFCCC in 2015 and which became the EU's NDC in 2016 upon EU ratification.

The NDC assessed is the NDC as contained in the UNFCCC's interim NDC registry, as submitted on 13 October 2016. The EU's NDC is dated 'Riga, 6 March 2015', and can be found in the UNFCCC's interim NDC registry at https://www4.unfccc.int/sites/ndcstaging/PublishedDocuments/Sweden%20First/EU%20First%20NDC.pdf

Element of ICTU	Included in NDC	Category of assessment	Information in NDC and assessment		
1. Quantifiable information on the reference point (including, as appropriate, a base year):					
(a) reference year(s), base year(s), reference period(s) or other starting point(s)	Yes Partly No n/a	<ul> <li>Reference year(s) – including for reduction against a baseline</li> <li>Base year(s)</li> <li>Reference period(s)</li> <li>other starting point(s)</li> </ul>	The EU's NDC specifies its target (at least 40% domestic reduction in emissions by 2030) relative to a 1990 base year.		
(b) Quantifiable information on the reference indicators, their values in the reference year(s), base year(s), reference period(s) or other starting point(s), and, as applicable, in the target year;  (If 1 (c) is completed, this is not applicable)	Yes Partly No n/a	<ul> <li>Quantified – in CO<sub>2</sub> or CO<sub>2</sub>-eq or in other emissions units</li> <li>Quantified – other units</li> <li>Quantifiable information provided – to quantify in CO<sub>2</sub> or CO<sub>2</sub>-eq</li> <li>Quantifiable information provided – to quantify in other units</li> <li>No quantifiable information</li> </ul>	Information is provided which would allov quantification in the base year in terms of the EU's GHG inventory.  However, insufficient clarity is provided on how land sector emissions and removals would be quantified and applied in relatio to the EU target (i.e. based on UNFCCC reporting categories or based on Kyoto Protocol categories/activities).		
(c) For strategies, plans and actions referred to in Article 4, paragraph 6, of the Paris Agreement, or polices and measures as components of nationally determined contributions where paragraph 1(b) above is not applicable, Parties to provide other relevant information;  (If 1(b) is completed, this is not applicable, unless a country has provided policies and measures as well)	Yes Partly No n/a	<ul> <li>The country has provided reference points for relevant quantified goals for specific PAMs.</li> <li>The country has provided reference point for qualitative goals for PAMs with non-quantified goals.</li> </ul>	Not applicable to the EU's NDC.		
(d) Target relative to the reference indicator, expressed numerically, for example in percentage or amount of reduction;	Yes No n/a	<ul> <li>% reduction from base year</li> <li>% reduction from BAU</li> <li>% intensity reduction from base year</li> <li>Other</li> </ul>	The EU's target is defined as "at least 40% domestic reduction in greenhouse gas emissions by 2030 compared to 1990".		
(e) Information on sources of data used in quantifying the reference point(s);	Yes Partly No n/a	Source: GHG inventory Reference to underlying data sources Other studies Enhanced conformance – traceability: Source readily found	The source of data for quantifying the reference point is not stated. It is assumed that this will be the GHG inventory.		

Element of ICTU	Included in NDC	Category of assessment	Information in NDC and assessment
(f) Information on the circumstances under which the Party may update the values of the reference indicators.	Yes No n/a	GHG inventory:  How values may be updated When  Baseline projections: Information on whether the baseline will be updated, when and why.  Intensity: If, whether and how the country will update its intensity reference indicator.	No information provided. It is assumed that the reference point may change with GHG inventory recalculations.
2. Time frames and/or period	ls for implemen	itation:	
(a) Time frame and/or period for implementation, including start and end date, consistent with any further relevant decision adopted by the Conference of the Parties serving as the meeting of the Parties to the Paris Agreement (CMA);	Yes Partly No	<ul> <li>Stated time frame of 5 years</li> <li>Stated time frame of 10 years</li> <li>Other stated time frame</li> <li>Start date: 1 January 2021</li> <li>End date: 31 December 2030</li> </ul>	Period of implementation provided: 1 January 2021-31 December 2030.
(b) Whether it is a single-year or multi-year target, as applicable.	Yes No	<ul><li>Single-year target</li><li>Multi-year target</li></ul>	Implied single year target for 2030, but information not explicitly provided.
3. Scope and coverage:			
(a) General description of the target	Yes No	<ul> <li>Key goals of the target – emissions reduction/limitation, intensity, BAU reduction, PAMs, mitigation co-benefits, in quantitative or qualitative terms.</li> <li>Time frame, period of implementation, target year(s).</li> </ul>	General description provided – reduction by at least 40% by 2030 relative to 1990 levels, economy-wide.
(b) Sectors, gases, categories and pools covered by the nationally determined contribution, including, as applicable, consistent with Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) guidelines;	Yes Partly No	Sectors:  Energy IPPU AFOLU – specified separately for land use and agriculture LULUCF (if specified separately from above) Agriculture (if specified separately from above) Waste Other Categories: Categories and sub-categories used for each sector above in the NDC Gases: Carbon dioxide: CO2 Methane: CH4 Nitrous oxide: N2O Perfluorocarbons: PFCs Hydrofluorocarbons: PFCs Nitrogen trifluoride: SF6 Nitrogen trifluoride: NF3 Pools: Aboveground biomass Belowground biomass Dead wood Litter Soil organic matter	Information provided on coverage of IPCC sectors, on gases, and on applicable IPCC guidelines (2006 and KP land use supplement from 2013). No specific information was provided on carbon pools It is not clear on what terms the land secto will be included in the target.

Element of ICTU	Included in NDC	Category of assessment	Information in NDC and assessment
4. Planning processes:			
(a) Information on the planning processes that the Party undertook to prepare its nationally determined contribution and, if available, on the Party's implementation plans, including, as appropriate:			
(i) Domestic institutional arrangements, public participation and engagement with local communities and indigenous peoples, in a gender-responsive manner;	Yes Partly No	Domestic institutional arrangements:  No information provided  Some information provided  Detailed information provided  Public participation and engagement:  No information provided  Some information provided  Detailed information provided  Information on stakeholder engagement:  No information provided  Information on engagement with local communities provided  Information on engagement with indigenous peoples provided  Information on other stakeholder engagement provided	No information was provided in the EU's NDC on the arrangements in place to prepare the NDC. No information was provided on the relevant stakeholder processes, or whether the NDC was conducted in a gender-responsive manner, whether local communities and indigenous peoples were consulted.
		Does the country report on whether the NDC process was conducted in a gender-responsive manner?:  No information provided Some information provided Detailed information provided	
((i).cont.)if available, information provided on a Party's implementation plans;		Implementation plans:  No information provided Some information provided  Enhanced conformance:  Detailed information on how implementation plans will achieve the objectives of its NDC.	Some information was provided on the implementation of EU climate policy. It is implied and not stated that this will constitute the implementation of the NDC.

Element of ICTU	Included in NDC	Category of assessment	Information in NDC and assessment
to be implemented to contribute to mitigation co-benefits, including information on adaptation plans that also yield mitigation co-benefits, which may cover, but are not limited to, key sectors, such as energy, resources, water resources, coastal resources, human settlements and urban planning, agriculture and forestry; and economic diversification actions, which may cover, but are not limited to, sectors such as manufacturing and industry, energy and mining, transport and communication, construction, tourism, real estate, agriculture and fisheries.	Yes No n/a	The NDC contains information on specific projects, measures and activities for adaptation resulting in mitigation cobenefits in:  Energy resources  Water resources  Coastal resources  Human settlements  Urban planning  Agriculture and forestry  Other  Specific projects, measures and activities for economic diversification actions in sectors resulting in mitigation co-benefits:  Manufacturing and industry  Energy and mining  Transport and communication  Construction, tourism  Real estate  Agriculture and fisheries  Other	Not applicable.
		aches, including those for estimating s and, as appropriate, removals:	g and accounting for
(a) Assumptions and methodological approaches used for accounting for anthropogenic greenhouse gas emissions and removals corresponding to the Party's nationally determined contribution, consistent with decision 1/CP.21, paragraph 31, and accounting guidance adopted by the CMA;	Yes No	<ul> <li>A general description of the accounting approach.</li> <li>Detailed description of how the country will account for the land sector in its NDC.</li> </ul>	No information is provided on how emissions and removals will be accounted for (other than the specification that it will be a "comprehensive accounting framework, activity or land-based approach, for emissions and removals from land use, land use change and forestry"), and the NDC states that the way in which the land sector will be accounted for will be decided in future.
(b) Assumptions and methodological approaches used for accounting for the implementation of policies and measures or strategies in the nationally determined	Yes Partly No	No information provided Some information provided Detailed information provided	Not applicable – the EU's NDC is not stated in terms of policies and measures.

emissions and removals corresponding to the Party's nationally determined contribution, consistent with decision 1/CP.21, paragraph 31, and accounting guidance adopted by the CMA;		<ul> <li>Detailed description of how the country will account for the land sector in its NDC.</li> </ul>	be a "comprehensive accounting framework, activity or land-based approach, for emissions and removals from land use, land use change and forestry"), and the NDC states that the way in which the land sector will be accounted for will be decided in future.
<ul> <li>(b) Assumptions and methodological approaches used for accounting for the implementation of policies and measures or strategies in the nationally determined contribution;</li> </ul>	Yes Partly No n/a	No information provided Some information provided Detailed information provided	Not applicable – the EU's NDC is not stated in terms of policies and measures.
(c) If applicable, information on how the Party will take into account existing methods and guidance under the Convention to account for anthropogenic emissions and removals, in accordance with Article 4, paragraph 14, of the Paris Agreement, as appropriate;	Yes Partly No	<ul> <li>The country has specified that they will use existing methods and guidance.</li> <li>The country has specified that they will not use existing methods and guidance.</li> <li>The country has not provided any information on this.</li> </ul>	No information provided on this. The approach to the land sector is undefined.
(d) IPCC methodologies and metrics used for estimating anthropogenic greenhouse gas emissions and removals;	Yes Partly No n/a	<ul> <li>The country has specified in their NDC whether they have used 1996 or 2006 IPCC guidelines for estimating emissions and removals, and/or other IPCC guidance.</li> <li>The country has specified which GWP values it is using (from which IPCC assessment report).</li> <li>The NDC target is not expressed in GHG emissions terms, and contains no relevant information on GHG emissions (not applicable).</li> </ul>	The EU NDC specifies that IPCC 2006 guidelines and the IPCC 2013 KP Supplement have been used for estimating emissions, and that GWPs from the IPCC 4th Assessment Report were used.

	Element of ICTU	Included in NDC	Category of assessment	Information in NDC and assessment
(e)	Sector-, category- or activity-specific assumptions, methodologies and approaches consistent with IPCC guidance, as appropriate, including, as applicable:			
(i)	Approach to addressing emissions and subsequent removals from natural disturbances on managed lands:	Yes No n/a	<ul> <li>Approach to addressing emissions and removals on managed lands reported in the NDC.</li> <li>No information included in the NDC.</li> </ul>	No information included.
(ii)	Approach used to account for emissions and removals from harvested wood products;	Yes No n/a	<ul><li>Approach to harvested wood products reported.</li><li>No information included in the NDC.</li></ul>	No information included.
(iii)	Approach used to address the effects of age-class structure in forests;	Yes No n/a	<ul><li>Approach to age-class structure in forests reported.</li><li>No information included in the NDC.</li></ul>	No information included.
(f)	Other assumptions and methodological approaches used for understanding the nationally determined contribution and, if applicable, estimating corresponding emissions and removals, including:			
(i)	How the reference indicators, baseline(s) and/or reference level(s), including, where applicable, sector-, category- or activity-specific reference levels, are constructed, including, for example, key parameters, assumptions, definitions, methodologies, data sources and models used;	<ul><li>Yes</li><li>Partly</li><li>No</li><li>n/a</li></ul>	If the Party has chosen a mitigation target relative to a reference level, including emissions reference levels, base years, intensity targets etc:  Method for estimating the reference level.  Sources of data, as applicable.	Approach to the land sector is not specified.
			If the Party has chosen a mitigation target relative to a baseline scenario:  Base year  Key assumptions (GDP, population, etc)  Methodology (analytical tool) and  Resulting projection at least up to the end year  Data sources	
(ii)	For Parties with nationally determined contributions that contain non- greenhouse-gas components, information on assumptions and methodological approaches used in relation to those components, as applicable;	Yes Partly No n/a	Assumptions and methodologies for non-GHG components:  Quantified in a manner where mitigation outcomes are clear.  Quantifiable, but requiring assumptions to understand mitigation outcomes.  Not quantifiable.	Not applicable.
(iii)	For climate forcers included in nationally determined contributions not covered by IPCC guidelines, information on how the climate forcers are estimated;	Yes No n/a	<ul> <li>The NDC includes black carbon, and includes information on how it is estimated.</li> <li>The NDC includes other short-lived climate forcers, and information on how these are estimated.</li> </ul>	Not applicable.

Element of ICTU	Included in NDC	Category of assessment	Information in NDC and assessment
(iv) Further technical information, as necessary;	Yes No n/a	Further information provided:  Yes  No  Not Applicable	The EU's NDC would be sufficiently transparent if all information required by the Annex to 4/CMA.1 was provided; hence additional technical information is not required.
(g) The intention to use voluntary cooperation under Article 6 of the Paris Agreement, if applicable.	Yes No	<ul> <li>Information on whether the country intends to participate in Article 6 activities during the NDC implementation period.</li> <li>Information on whether the country intends to use ITMOs to achieve its NDC.</li> </ul> Enhanced conformance:	The EU's NDC states that it does not intend to use any contribution from international market mechanisms to achieve its target.
		<ul> <li>The extent to which the target depends on use of ITMOs.</li> </ul>	



# 6. How the Party considers that its nationally determined contribution is fair and ambitious in the light of its national circumstances:

(a) How the Party considers that its nationally determined contribution is fair and ambitious in the light of its national circumstances;	Fair  Yes  No  Ambitious  Yes  No	<ul> <li>Inclusion of grounds for why the NDC target is fair.</li> <li>Inclusion of grounds for why the NDC target is ambitious.</li> </ul>	The EU NDC implies, in the relevant section, that its NDC is fair and ambitious. The EU NDC supports this with the following:  a) the 2030 target is consistent with a developed-country emissions outcome in 2050 of 80-95% reduction compared to 1990 levels (referenced to the IPCC without more details), b) that this is a considerable progression on the 2020 target, and c) that EU per capita emissions are projected to fall to 6 tons/capita in 2030. No grounds are provided for why this would be a fair outcome.
b) Fairness considerations, including reflecting on equity;	<ul><li>Yes</li><li>Partly</li><li>No</li></ul>	The country has provided in its NDC:  References to equity analyses by international experts.  References to equity analyses by incountry experts.  References to indicators found in equity literature.  References to the application of preferred equity indicators to other countries.	The EU provides very few grounds other than a reference to per capita emissions as to how its NDC could be considered fair.

#### For questions, please contact

#### Sebastian Wegner

International Secretariat of Climate Transparency swegner@governance-platform.org

#### **Acknowledgements**

A particular thanks goes to Andrew Marquard and Harald Winkler (University of Cape Town) for leading the development of the methodology of this assessment as well as to Climate Transparency partners for review.

For further details please refer to the methodology which can be downloaded under www.climate-transparency.org.



Since 1991 and under the motto of 'Observing, Analysing, Acting', Germanwatch has been committed to global equity and the preservation of livelihoods. The politics and economics of the North, with their global consequences, stand at the centre of our work.

### **IDDRI**

IDDRI is an independent policy research institute and a multi-stakeholder dialogue platform that identifies the conditions and proposes tools to put sustainable development at the heart of international relations and public and private policies.



The Humboldt-Viadrina Governance Platform is a not-for-profit organization based in Berlin, Germany. Its mission is to strengthen participation and transparency for sustainable solutions of societal challenges. For this, the Governance Platform brings together the government, business and civil society as well as academia and media. Based on this conviction the Governance Platform develops governance concepts and projects for sustainable solutions that are guided towards the common good. The organization hosts the international secretariat of Climate Transparency, in collaboration with Climate Analytics.



Climate Analytics was formed in 2008 to bring cutting edge science and policy analysis to bear on one of the most pressing global problems of our time: human-induced climate change.



Climate Transparency is a global partnership with a shared mission to stimulate a "race to the top" in climate action in G20 countries through enhanced transparency. It convenes partners from Argentina (Fundación Ambiente y Recursos Naturales), Australia (Climate Analytics), Brazil (CentroClima/COPPE UFRJ), China (Energy Research Institute), France (The Institute for Sustainable Development and International Relations), Germany (Germanwatch HUMBOLDT-VIADRINA Governance Platform, NewClimate Institute), India (The Energy and Resources Institute), Indonesia (Institute for Essential Service Reform), Japan (The Institute for Global Environmental Strategies), Mexico (Iniciativa Climática de México), South Africa (Energy Research Center/University of Cape Town) and the UK (Overseas Development Institute).

Climate Transparency is funded by the ClimateWorks Foundation, European Climate Foundation, The Federal Ministry for the Environment, Nature Conservation and Nuclear Safety (BMU) and the World Bank.

www.climate-transparency.org